BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06081331 8

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

CRIMINAL LAW

VOLUME 1

Professor Markus Dubber

Fall 2011

CRIMINAL LAW

VOLUME 1

Professor Markus Dubber

Fall 2011

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/criminallaw01dubb

Table of Contents[†]

Part I. Fundamentals & Frameworks
Chapter 1. The Province of Criminal Law*
A. Law and Police
Dubber, Police Power Model of the Criminal Process
Morris, Persons and Punishment
B. Public Law and Private Law
Dubber, Criminal Law Between Public and Private Law
1. Criminal Law and Tort Law
Linden & Feldthusen, Functions of Tort Law
— Assault in Crime and Tort
— Tort, Crime, and Compensation for Victims
2. Criminal Law and Victim Compensation Law
McMurtry Report
R. v. Cuerrier; N.C. v. W.R.B.; Re Jane Doe (CICB)
C. The Canadian Criminal Code: Past, Present, Future?
Friedland, Codification in the Commonwealth
Linden, Recodifying Canadian Criminal Law
Stephen, General View of the Criminal Law of England (1863)
Criminal Code Bill Commission, Report (1879)
Stephen, Liberty, Equality, Fraternity (1874)
Stephen, A History of the Criminal Law of England (1883)
Self-Defense: A History in Codes

Chapter 2. Theories and Concepts of Punishment **vol. 1**
A. Theories ---- 1
R. v. C.A.M. ---- 1
R. Christie ---- 13
U.S. Federal Sentencing Guidelines ---- 19
B. Concepts ---- 25
R. v. Lyons ---- 25
R. v. L.M. ---- 36
R. v. Cross ---- 41
Hörnle, Human Rights Issues ---- 55

Chapter 3. Sources and Limits of the Power to Punish ---- 57
A. POGG and Criminal Law Power ---- 57
Margarine Reference ---- 57
R. v. Hydro-Québec ---- 59
Constitution Act, 1867 (esp. ss. 91 & 92)*
Valverde, "Peace, Order, and Good Government"*

[†] Materials marked with an asterisk (*) are available on Blackboard only. All other materials appear in the bound coursebook; excerpts from the Law Reform Commission of Canada's draft criminal code (LRCC), the American Law Institute's Model Penal Code (MPC), and the German Criminal Code (StGB) can be found in the bound code supplement. Everything bound is also available online, but not vice versa.

Holy Roman Empire of the German Nation, First Imperial Police Ordinance (1530)*
N.Y. State Police Regulations, 1781-1801*
B. Harm Principle ----64
R. v. Malmo-Levine ----64
Stephen, Liberty, Equality, Fraternity ----70
Dubber, Rechtsgut and Harm Principle*

Chapter 4. Legality Principle (*nullum crimen sine lege*) ----73
A. Rule of Law/*Rechtsstaat* ----73
Fuller, Morality of Law*
Dubber, The Principle of Legality*
B. Legislativity ----73
Frey v. Fedoruk ----73
Shaw v. DPP ----79
C. Specificity ----83
R. v. Nova Scotia Pharmaceutical Society ----83
D. Strict Construction/Lenity ----90
R. v. Robinson ----90
R. v. Paré ----94
R. v. McIntosh ---- 96
R. v. Sharpe ---- 96
R. v. L.B. ---- 97
E. Prospectivity ----97
Application under s. 83.28 of the Criminal Code ----97
F. Publicity ---- 104
R. v. Furtney ---- 104
G. Codification ---- 106
United Nurses of Alberta v. Alberta ---- 106

Chapter 5. Jurisdiction ---- 116
R. v. Stucky ---- 116
Davidson v. British Columbia ---- 117
Code of Service Discipline ---- 123
German Penal Code ---- 126

Chapter 6. Analysis of Criminal Liability ---- 129
A. Three Levels of Liability ---- 129
Dubber, Comparative Analysis of Criminal Liability ---- 130
Criminal Code Bill Commission, Report (1879) ---- 131
B. German Scheme ---- 131
Naucke, Insider's Perspective ---- 131
C. Victim Compensation Scheme ---- 133
Dubber, Analysis of Compensability ---- 133
Compensation for Victims of Crime Act (Ont.)*
D. Tort Scheme ---- 134

Linden, Tort Defences & German Civil Code § 823 ---- 134
E. An Application: The Queen v. Dudley and Stephens ---- 135
The Queen v. Dudley and Stephens ---- 135

Part II. General Principles of Criminal Law ---- 138
Chapter 7. Actus Reus (Objective Offense Elements) ---- 138
A. Actness ---- 138
People v. Davis ---- 138
LRCC §§ 2(2)-2(3)(a) ---- 140
MPC §§ 1.13(5), (9), 2.01 ---- 141
B. Voluntariness ---- 141
R. v. Larsonneur ---- 141
R. v. Shaw ---- 142
Hill v. Baxter ---- 143
LRCC § 3(1) ---- 145
MPC § 2.01 ---- 145
C. Omission ---- 145
R. v. Instan ---- 145
People v. Robbins ---- 147
State v. Miranda ---- 149
R. v. Browne ---- 153
Fagan v. Commissioner of Metropolitan Police ---- 156
R. v. Miller ---- 158
R. v. Thornton ---- 160
LRCC § 2(3) ---- 164
MPC § 2.01 ---- 164
StGB § 13 ---- 165
French Penal Code Arts. 223-6, 7 ---- 165
StGB § 323c ---- 165
LRCC § 10(2) ---- 165
Quebéc Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms §§ 1, 2 ---- 166
D. Possession ---- 166
1. Significance and Variety ---- 166
Dubber, Policing Possession ---- 166
Possession in the Canadian Criminal Code ---- 168
2. "Actus Reus" ---- 169
An Act for the better preventing the counterfeiting the current coin… ---- 169
An Act for the better prevention of offences… ---- 170
R. v. Lennard ---- 170
R. v. Dugdale ---- 172
LRCC § 2(3) (comment) ---- 174
MPC § 2.01(4) ---- 174
Dubber, Policing Possession ---- 174
3. Varieties of Possession ---- 175
a. actual (physical) ---- 175
R. v. Hess ---- 175

R. v. Beaver ---- 178
b. constructive ---- 184
(i) personal ---- 184
R. v. Christie ---- 184
(ii) joint ---- 187
R. v. Chambers ---- 187
4. Presumptions ---- 191
R. v. Oakes ---- 191
Dubber, Policing Possession ---- 198

Chapter 8. Mens Rea (Subjective Offense Elements) ---- 200
A. Voluntariness and Culpable Mental States ---- 200
In the Matter of Ronnie L. ---- 200
B. Schemes of Mental States ---- 203
C. Definitions ---- 204
LRCC § 2(4) ---- 204
MPC § 2.02, N.Y. Penal Law § 15.05 ---- 204
StGB § 15 ---- 205
StGB (Alternative Draft) §§ 17, 18 ---- 205
D. The Boundaries of Intent: Varieties of Subjective Fault ---- 206
R. v. Lewis ---- 206
R. v. Dunbar ---- 208
R. v. Paquette ---- 210
R. v. Buzzanga ---- 212
MPC § 2.02(8) ---- 225
R. v. Hibbert ---- 225
R. v. Moo ---- 238
E. The Boundaries of Culpability: Subjective vs. Objective Fault ---- 242
R. v. G and another ---- 242
R. v. Tutton and Tutton ---- 249
R. v. Hundal ---- 260
R v. Beatty ---- 267
F. Constitutional Constraints ---- 281
1. Strict and Absolute Liability ---- 281
R. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie ---- 281
Reference Re: Section 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act ---- 287
R. v. Wholesale Travel Group Inc. ---- 293
Sayre, Public Welfare Offenses ---- 319
Morissette v. United States ---- 320
MPC §§ 2.02(3), (4), 2.05 ---- 321
2. Constructive Murder ---- 321
R. v. Vaillancourt ---- 322
R. v. Martineau ---- 331
LRCC § 6(3) ---- 343
MPC §§ 210.2, .3 ---- 344
StGB § 211-213 ---- 344

3. Foreseeability ---- 345
R. v. DeSousa ---- 345
R. v. Creighton ---- 352

Chapter 9. Causation **vol. 2**
R. v. Roberts ---- 375
R. v. Pagett ---- 377
R. v. Cheshire ---- 378
R. v. Smithers ---- 383
R. v. Blaue ---- 384
R. v. Cribbin ---- 386
R. v. Nette ---- 392
R. v. Sinclair ---- 407
People v. Kibbe ---- 408
LRCC § 2(6) ---- 410
MPC § 2.03 ---- 410

Chapter 10. Inchoate Crimes ---- 411
A. Attempt ---- 411
1. Concepts and Types of Attempt ---- 411
LRCC § 4(3) ---- 411
StGB §§ 22-23 ---- 411
MPC §§ 5.01, 5.05(1) ---- 411
2. Mens Rea ---- 411
R. v. Lajoie ---- 411
R. v. Ancio ---- 416
3. "Actus Reus": Incomplete Attempts ---- 421
R. v. Cline ---- 421
R. v. Sorrell and Bondett ---- 425
R. v. Deutsch ---- 430
People v. Lehnert ---- 434
4. Impossibility ---- 437
USA v. Dynar ---- 437
People v. Dlugash ---- 447
B. Counselling ---- 449
R. v. Hamilton ---- 449
LRCC § 4(4) ---- 457
MPC § 5.02 ---- 457
C. Conspiracy ---- 457
R. v. Dèry ---- 457
USA v. Dynar ---- 464
LRCC § 4(5) ---- 471
MPC § 5.03(1), (5), (6) ---- 471

Chapter 11. Liability for Another's Conduct ---- 472
A. Concepts and Types of Derivative Liability ---- 472

LRCC § 4(1), 4(2) ---- 472
StGB §§ 25, 26, 27, 29 ---- 472
MPC § 2.06(1)-(3), (6)(c) ---- 472
B. Complicity ---- 472
R. v. Dunlop and Sylvester ---- 472
R. v. Popen ---- 477
R. v. Dooley ---- 480
R. v. Logan ---- 482
R. v. Kirkness ---- 489
R. v. Hibbert ---- 491
R. v. Briscoe ---- 491
R. v. Hughes ---- 496
R. v. J.F. ---- 498
C. Abandonment ---- 501
R. v. Ball ---- 501
R. v. Gonzague ---- 502
People v. Staples ---- 506
StGB § 24 ---- 507
MPC §§ 2.06(6)(c), 5.01(4), 5.02(3), 5.03(6) ---- 507
N.Y. Penal Law § 40.10 ---- 507
D. Vicarious Liability (respondeat superior) ---- 508
R. v. Hawinda Taverns Ltd. ---- 508
E. Corporate Liability ---- 510
R. v. Waterloo Mercury Sales Ltd. ---- 510
R. v. Canadian Dredge and Dock Co. Ltd. et al. ---- 510
CCC ss. 22.1 & 22.2 ---- 515
LRCC § 2(5) ---- 516
MPC § 2.07 ---- 516
People v. Congregational Khal Chaisidei Skwere, Inc. ---- 516
Weigend, "Societas delinquere non potest?" ---- 517

Chapter 12. Mistake & Intoxication ---- 525
A. Mistake ---- 525
1. Mistake of Fact ---- 525
R. v. Rees ---- 525
R. v. Metro News Ltd. ---- 527
R. v. Pappajohn ---- 531
R. v. Sansregret ---- 544
R. v. Osolin ---- 552
R. v. Ladue ---- 563
R. v. Burgess ---- 565
R. v. Vlcko ---- 565
R. v. Kundeus ---- 566
LRCC § 3(2) ---- 576
MPC § 2.04(1) ---- 576
StGB § 16 ---- 576

2. Mistake of Law ---- 576
R. v. Campbell and Mlynarchuk ---- 576
R. v. Ross --- ---- 580
The Statutory Instruments Act ---- 582
R. v. Molis ---- 583
R. v. Pontes ---- 586
R. v. Docherty ---- 604
People v. Coe ---- 606
R. v. Dalley ---- 608
R. v. Forster ---- 610
R. v. Jorgensen ---- 612
Lévis (City) v. Tétreault ---- 617
R. v. Pena ---- 619
LRCC § 3(7) ---- 623
MPC § 2.04(3), (4) ---- 623
StGB § 17 ---- 624
B. Intoxication ---- 624
DDP v. Beard ---- 624
DPP v. Majewski ---- 627
R. v. Bernard ---- 630
R. v. Daviault ---- 642
LRCC § 3(3) ---- 663
MPC § 2.08 ---- 663
StGB § 323a ---- 663

Chapter 13. Justification **vol. 3**
A. Concepts and Types of Defense ---- 664
Blackstone, Commentaries ---- 664
Criminal Code Bill Commission, Report ---- 665
R. v. Perka ---- 665
Naucke, "An Insider's Perspective" ---- 665
LRCC ch. 3 ---- 666
N.Y. Penal Law § 25 ---- 666
Patterson v. New York ---- 666
R. v. Whyte ---- 667
B. Protection of Persons Administering and Enforcing the Law ---- 667
R. v. Brennan ---- 667
LRCC § 3(13) ---- 671
MPC §§ 3.03, 3.07 ---- 672
C. Persons in Authority ---- 672
Canadian Foundation for Children, Youth and the Law v. Canada ---- 672
LRCC § 3(14) ---- 686
MPC § 3.08 ---- 686
D. Self-Defense ---- 686
R. v. Pétel ---- 686
R. v. McIntosh ---- 688

R. v. Pawliuk ---------- 695
R. v. Lavallee ---------- 699
R. v. Deegan ---------- 715
R. v. Faid ---------- 716
R. v. Webers ---------- 716
R. v. Baxter ---------- 718
LRCC § 3(10) ---------- 722
MPC § 3.03 ---------- 722
StGB §§ 32-33 ---------- 722
E. Consent ---------- 722
R. v. Jobidon ---------- 722
R. v. Cuerrier ---------- 738
R. v. Ewanchuk ---------- 759
R. v. Crangle ---------- 770
LRCC § 1(2) ---------- 775
MPC § 2.11 ---------- 775
F. Necessity ---------- 775
The Queen v. Dudley and Stephens ---------- 775
R. v. Perka ---------- 775
R. v. Latimer ---------- 795
LRCC § 3(9) ---------- 802
MPC § 3.02 ---------- 802
StGB § 34 ---------- 802
Chapter 14. Excuse ---------- 803
A. Incapacity ("Exemption") ---------- 803
1. Insanity ---------- 803
a. Definition ---------- 803
R. v. Cooper ---------- 803
R. v. Kjeldsen ---------- 809
R. v. Abbey ---------- 810
R. v. Kirkby ---------- 811
R. v. Schwartz ---------- 812
R. v. Chaulk ---------- 817
Winko v. British Columbia (Forensic Psychiatric Institute) ---------- 823
R. v. Whittle ---------- 836
Stephen, 1879 Draft Bill ---------- 838
Criminal Code Bill Commission, 1879 Draft Bill ---------- 839
Canadian Criminal Code, 1892 ---------- 839
Canadian Criminal Code (current) ---------- 839
LRCC § 3(6) ---------- 840
MPC § 4.01 ---------- 840
StGB § 20 ---------- 840
b. Defense (vs. Element of Liability vs. Symptom vs. Offense) ---------- 840
R. v. Saxell ---------- 840
R. v. Swain ---------- 841

c. Burden of Proof ---- 856
R. v. Chaulk ---- 856
People v. Kohl ---- 877
d. Diminished Responsibility ---- 879
R. v. More ---- 879
R. v. Wright ---- 882
MPC §§ 4.02, 210.3(1)(b) ---- 885
StGB § 21 ---- 885
e. Irresistible Impulse ---- 885
R. v. Borg ---- 885
2. Infancy ---- 890
R. v. Sawchuk ---- 890
R. v. Ogg-Moss ---- 891
LRCC § 3(4) ---- 897
MPC § 4.10 ---- 897
StGB § 19 ---- 897
3. "Insane Automatism" ---- 897
R. v. Quick ---- 897
R. v. Rabey ---- 901
R. v. Parks ---- 911
R. v. Stone ---- 920
B. Inability ---- 952
1. Duress ---- 952
R. v. Carker (No. 2) ---- 952
R. v. Hibbert ---- 955
R. v. Ruzic ---- 965
LRCC § 3(8) ---- 978
MPC § 2.09 ---- 978
StGB § 35 ---- 978
2. Provocation ---- 978
R. v. Hill ---- 978
R. v. Galgay ---- 988
R. v. Thibert ---- 989
R. v. Parent ---- 997
MPC § 210(3)(1)(b) ---- 1001
StGB § 213 ---- 1001
3. Entrapment ---- 1001
R. v. Mack ---- 1001
R. v. Barnes ---- 1020
MPC § 2.13 ---- 1030
N.Y. Penal Law § 40.05 ---- 1030
People v. DeGina ---- 1031
Ross, Tradeoffs in Undercover Investigations ---- 1032